“Attenzione”: is Italy putting its investment grade rating at risk?

The odd one out: five-year CDS levels (bp) versus S&P credit rating

- **Pressure from higher-yield spreads**: Italy’s radical government plans to flout EU fiscal rules in 2019 and beyond (see *The trouble in Rome*). Even if Rome manages to dodge a fine from the EU, investors are concerned. The spread of Italian 10-year bonds over German Bunds surged to a painfully high level this week, briefly surpassing 300bp.

- **The fiscal plans do not add up**: Italy’s government projects that the budget deficit will rise from 2.0% in 2018 to 2.4% in 2019 before falling to 2.1% in 2020. But this is based on over-optimistic GDP growth forecasts of 1.5% for 2019 and 1.6% for 2020. We expect a deficit of 2.8% for the next two years with GDP growth close to 1% instead.

- **The odd one out**: Judging by the default risk now implied in Italy’s credit default swaps, rating agencies are behind the curve (see chart). Currently, the three major rating agencies (Standard & Poor's (S&P), Moody’s and Fitch) put Italy two notches above the threshold, while lesser-known DBRS is three notches above. Emerging markets, such as Vietnam, South Africa and Brazil, have lower CDS levels than Italy but are rated below investment grade (BB+ or lower).

- **Rating agencies tend to move slowly**: Rome still has time to correct its fiscal course. While S&P and Moody’s could revise their Italian ratings at the end of October, a downgrade by more than one notch is unlikely. However, if Italy does not convince markets and rating agencies that its bonds remain safe and that it would rather change course than possibly ponder a euro exit if the going gets rough, it may lose its investment grade status in 2019.

- **Losing the investment grade status would hurt**: First, many institutional investors who buy only investment grade paper may be forced to sell their Italian bonds. Second, the European Central Bank (ECB) can buy only investment grade bonds under its asset purchase programme (APP). While net purchases stop at the end of 2018, Italy might lose out on ECB reinvestments of its maturing debt thereafter. Luckily for Italy, under a first-best rule, the ECB takes the best rating from just one of the four credit agencies. Third, Italy’s banks would suffer from the sovereign-bank doom loop. The ECB could not accept Italian bonds as collateral any more, forcing banks to use more-expensive refinancing options. Higher borrowing costs would hurt demand and weigh on Italy’s already weak GDP growth.

- **Serious risks**: Our base case remains that Italy will muddle through noisily. It will not lose its investment grade status and will not succumb to a debt crisis soon. However, the risks are far from trivial. Italy’s fiscal plans are testing the limits of investor patience. Rome’s fiery rhetoric exacerbates the risks. If Italy oversteps the limits and triggers a spiral of capital flight, ratings downgrades and plunging economic confidence, it may eventually face the tough choice Greece had to make in mid-2015: descend into the chaos of a euro exit or make the painful policy-U-turn back to prudence and pro-growth reforms. Any help from the European Stability Mechanism and the ECB would come with clear conditions attached (think Greece). And even if – as we expect – Italy dodges the bullet now, reform reversals could still make the country a prime candidate for a debt crisis once the next global recession (due perhaps in 2021 on current US cyclical dynamics) exposes Italy’s underlying fiscal and structural weaknesses.
Disclaimer

This document was compiled by the above mentioned authors of the economics department of Joh. Berenberg, Gossler & Co. KG (hereinafter referred to as “the Bank”). The Bank has made any effort to carefully research and process all information. The information has been obtained from sources which we believe to be reliable such as, for example, Thomson Reuters, Bloomberg and the relevant specialised press. However, we do not assume liability for the correctness and completeness of all information given. The provided information has not been checked by a third party, especially an independent auditing firm. We explicitly point to the stated date of preparation. The information given can become incorrect due to passage of time and/or as a result of legal, political, economic or other changes. We do not assume responsibility to indicate such changes and/or to publish an updated document. The forecasts contained in this document or other statements on rates of return, capital gains or other accession are the personal opinion of the author and we do not assume liability for the realisation of these.

This document is only for information purposes. It does not constitute investment advice or recommendation to buy financial instruments. It does not replace consulting regarding legal, tax or financial matters.

Remarks regarding foreign investors

The preparation of this document is subject to regulation by German law. The distribution of this document in other jurisdictions may be restricted by law, and persons, into whose possession this document comes, should inform themselves about, and observe, any such restrictions.

United Kingdom

This document is meant exclusively for institutional investors and market professionals, but not for private customers. It is not for distribution to or the use of private investors or private customers.

United States of America

This document has been prepared exclusively by Joh. Berenberg, Gossler & Co. KG. Although Berenberg Capital Markets LLC, an affiliate of the Bank and registered US broker-dealer, distributes this document to certain customers, Berenberg Capital Markets LLC does not provide input into its contents, nor does this document constitute research of Berenberg Capital Markets LLC. In addition, this document is meant exclusively for institutional investors and market professionals, but not for private customers. It is not for distribution to or the use of private investors or private customers.

This document is classified as objective for the purposes of FINRA rules. Please contact Berenberg Capital Markets LLC (+1 646 949 9000), if you require additional information.

Copyright

The Bank reserves all the rights in this document. No part of the document or its content may be rewritten, copied, photocopied or duplicated in any form by any means or redistributed without the Bank’s prior written consent.

© 2018 Joh. Berenberg, Gossler & Co. KG